### **Insights on Canadian Society**

## Results from the 2016 Census: Earnings of immigrants and children of immigrants in official language minority populations



by René Houle

Release date: May 15, 2019



Statistics Canada Statistique Canada



#### How to obtain more information

For information about this product or the wide range of services and data available from Statistics Canada, visit our website, www.statcan.gc.ca.

You can also contact us by

email at STATCAN.infostats-infostats.STATCAN@canada.ca

telephone, from Monday to Friday, 8:30 a.m. to 4:30 p.m., at the following numbers:

•	Statistical Information Service	1-800-263-1136
•	National telecommunications device for the hearing impaired	1-800-363-7629
•	Fax line	1-514-283-9350

#### **Depository Services Program**

Inquiries line
 Fax line
 1-800-635-7943
 1-800-565-7757

#### Standards of service to the public

Statistics Canada is committed to serving its clients in a prompt, reliable and courteous manner. To this end, Statistics Canada has developed standards of service that its employees observe. To obtain a copy of these service standards, please contact Statistics Canada toll-free at 1-800-263-1136. The service standards are also published on <a href="https://www.statcan.gc.ca">www.statcan.gc.ca</a> under "Contact us" > "Standards of service to the public."

#### Note of appreciation

Canada owes the success of its statistical system to a long-standing partnership between Statistics Canada, the citizens of Canada, its businesses, governments and other institutions. Accurate and timely statistical information could not be produced without their continued co-operation and goodwill.

Published by authority of the Minister responsible for Statistics Canada

© Her Majesty the Queen in Right of Canada as represented by the Minister of Industry, 2019

All rights reserved. Use of this publication is governed by the Statistics Canada Open Licence Agreement.

An HTML version is also available.

Cette publication est aussi disponible en français.

by René Houle

Today, Insights on Canadian Society is releasing a study based on 2016 Census data. This study uses census information on first official language spoken (FOLS) and immigration.



#### Overview of the study

This study uses data from the 2016 Census in order to examine the employment earnings of individuals with an immigrant background (i.e., immigrants and children of immigrants) who are part of official language minorities in Canada. Two groups are examined: those with French as their first official language spoken (FOLS) living in Canada outside Quebec, and those with English as their FOLS living in Quebec. In this study, comparisons are made with groups belonging to the linguistic majority.

- In Canada outside Quebec, immigrants and the children of immigrants together accounted for 19% of the French-speaking population aged 25 to 59 in 2016. In Quebec, immigrants and the children of immigrants represented 65% of the English-speaking population in the same age group.
- Nearly one-half (47%) of French-speaking immigrants in Canada outside Quebec and 39% of those living in Quebec were from African countries. English-speaking immigrants were mainly from Asian countries, in both Canada outside Quebec (56%) and in Quebec (39%).
- In all linguistic groups, immigrants had lower earnings than individuals from the third generation or higher, and the children of immigrants had earnings that were closer to those of individuals from the third generation or higher (individuals whose parents were both born in Canada).
- In Canada outside Quebec, French-speaking people with an immigrant background (immigrants and children of immigrants) had similar or higher earnings than their English-speaking counterparts.
- In Quebec, English-speaking children of immigrants, as well as those from the third generation or higher, generally had lower earnings than their French-speaking counterparts.

#### Introduction

Although much work has been done on the economic integration of immigrants and the children of immigrants in Canada, few studies have examined their economic situation based on their official language minority (or majority) status. Yet one known determining factor in the economic integration of immigrants is their

knowledge of the country's official languages. The level of proficiency in the host country's language is positively associated with better economic integration (in terms of wages and labour market participation), an association that has been found in several Western countries, including Canada.<sup>2</sup> In this context, it is worth exploring

whether the level of economic integration of immigrants or children of immigrants whose first official language is the minority language is comparable to that of people with an immigrant background whose first official language is that of the majority, or whether the level of integration is lower because of a language barrier.

This issue is all the more important because immigration can contribute positively to the vitality of a minority language community when immigrants and their children can fully integrate into that community.<sup>3</sup> This integration is particularly important for French-speaking minority communities outside Quebec, as immigrants and their children are expected to be the only sources of population growth by 2036, while the third generation or higher population is expected to decrease in absolute numbers.<sup>4</sup>

The demographic situation of the English-language minority in Quebec differs in many ways from that of French-language minorities outside Quebec. The population of immigrants, children of immigrants and the third generation or higher whose first official language spoken (FOLS)<sup>5</sup> is English should grow in Quebec by 2036. In addition, the English-speaking population in Quebec is highly concentrated in the Montréal census metropolitan area, while the French-speaking population outside Quebec is spread over a wide area.

For the English-speaking immigrant population in Quebec, the issue of integration also differs. In the past, immigrants and their children tended to integrate more fully into the English-speaking minority, but this situation has evolved differently over the past 40 years, particularly because of language legislation. As a

result, the challenges of integrating populations with immigrant backgrounds into Canada's official language minority communities are complex.

The purpose of this study is to examine how immigrants and children of immigrants integrate economically in these minority language contexts. This study does so by using 2016 Census data in order to examine the employment earnings of these populations, based on their majority or minority language context and immigrant status. Specifically, this article provides answers to the following questions:

- I. How does the economic situation of the population with an immigrant background (i.e., immigrants and children of immigrants) compare with that of the third generation or higher among official language populations in Canada outside Quebec and in Quebec?
- Among the population with an immigrant background, how does the economic situation of the official language minority compare with that of the majority?

Because the three indicators examined in this article (annual earnings, weekly earnings of fulltime workers and the proportion of people with at least \$10,000 in employment income) vary not only by immigration status but also by other factors, regression models were used to compare populations. The statistical methods used in this article are described in the Data sources, methods and definitions section. Although Statistics Canada does not have an official definition for English-speaking or French-speaking populations, for the purpose of this study, English-speaking people refer

to those who reported English as FOLS, and French-speaking people refer to those who reported French as FOLS.

#### French-speaking immigrants are mainly from Africa, while English-speaking immigrants are mainly from Asia

There are differences in the proportion of immigrants and children of immigrants among those aged 25 to 59 in the four linguistic communities.

In Canada outside Quebec in 2016, immigrants accounted for 12% of the French-speaking population aged 25 to 59, while this figure was 7% for the children of immigrants. In total, the population with an immigrant background represented 19% of the Frenchspeaking population in this age group (representing 90,800 people). Among Canada's English-speaking community outside Quebec, almost half (44%) of the population had an immigrant background as 21% were immigrants and 23% were children of immigrants, resulting in a total of just over 5 million people with an immigrant background.

In Quebec, there were larger differences between the two communities. Among the population aged 25 to 59 with French as their FOLS, the 513,000 people with an immigrant background represented 16% of the total French-speaking population—10% were immigrants and 6% were children of immigrants. English speakers with an immigrant background (332,000 people) made up the majority of Quebec's Englishspeaking population (65%) in the same age group. This population was divided almost equally between immigrants (32%) and children of immigrants (34%).

Table 1

Demographic characteristics of immigrants<sup>1</sup>, by first official language spoken (FOLS), population aged 25 to 59 living outside Québec and in Québec, 2016

	Canada outside Quebec		Quebec	
	French FOLS	English FOLS	French FOLS	English FOLS
Distribution by region of ancestry		pero	rcent	
United States	0.2	1.9	0.1	2.5
Caribbean and Bermuda	8.4	3.9	12.2	5.1
Latin America	6.2	6.7	12.5	10.3
Western Europe	13.5	1.3	12.0	1.2
Eastern Europe	7.1	7.9	7.7	11.7
Northern Europe	0.3	3.3	0.1	1.6
Southern Europe	2.5	3.5	2.9	2.9
Sub-Saharan Africa	34.7	5.5	13.2	3.9
North Africa	12.2	1.3	25.8	6.6
West Asia	9.0	8.3	7.8	14.5
East Asia	2.3	17.5	2.3	13.4
Southeast Asia	1.5	15.6	2.7	11.7
South Asia	1.8	22.6	0.7	14.2
Oceania and other	0.1	8.0	0.1	0.3
Proportion of those who had a university degree	53.5	44.3	41.3	44.9
Proportion of immigrants admitted from 2010 to 2014	26.6	21.4	29.2	23.6
Proportion of refugees	21.7	13.3	13.8	15.4
Proportion of bilingual people (English–French)	90.7	2.8	51.2	49.2

1. Who were admitted in Canada between the ages of 15 to 59. **Source:** Statistics Canada, Census of Population, 2016.

Table 2
Demographic characteristics of children of immigrants, by first official language spoken (FOLS), population aged 25 to 59 living in Canada outside Québec and in Québec, 2016

	Canada				
	outside	Quebec	Que	ebec	
	French FOLS	English FOLS	French FOLS	English FOLS	
Distribution by region of ancestry		per	cent		
United States	10.2	6.0	5.8	4.4	
Caribbean and Bermuda	8.8	4.3	15.4	5.7	
Latin America	4.7	4.5	8.2	4.2	
Western Europe	23.0	13.8	20.2	6.5	
Eastern Europe	6.1	8.0	3.8	7.4	
Northern Europe	5.9	20.7	1.5	8.1	
Southern Europe	11.3	17.8	18.0	42.9	
Sub-Saharan Africa	7.8	2.0	2.9	1.4	
North Africa	5.7	0.5	8.2	2.7	
West Asia	6.2	2.7	6.6	5.6	
East Asia	3.6	7.5	2.0	3.5	
Southeast Asia	3.1	5.4	6.5	3.7	
South Asia	3.2	5.8	1.0	3.6	
Oceania and other	0.4	0.9	0.2	0.3	
Proportion with a university degree	47.3	35.6 33.6 36.		36.5	
Proportion of bilingual people (English–French)	97.9 8.4 81.3			88.1	

Source: Statistics Canada, Census of Population, 2016.

With respect to region of ancestry, French-speaking immigrants were mainly from Africa, while English-speaking immigrants were mainly from Asia (Table I). Close to one half (47%) of French-speaking immigrants living in Canada outside Quebec and 39% of those living in Quebec were from an African country. In Canada outside Quebec, just over one-third of French-speaking immigrants were from Sub-Saharan Africa, while in Quebec, just over one-quarter were from North Africa.

Among English-speaking immigrants, the percentage of immigrants from South Asia, East Asia and Southeast Asia was higher: 56% of those living in Canada outside Quebec came from one of these three regions, while this figure was 39% for those living in Quebec. Among immigrants with French as their FOLS, this percentage was 6%, both for those living in Canada outside Quebec and for those living in Quebec.

Between 40% and just over 50% of immigrants had a university degree. Among English-speaking immigrants, this figure was about the same (44% in Canada outside Quebec and 45% in Quebec); among French-speaking immigrants, the figure was 54% for those living in Canada outside Quebec and 41% for those living in Quebec.

The proportion of recent immigrants (admitted between 2010 and 2014) in all four linguistic groups varied between 21% and 29%. However, in terms of admission category, 22% of French-speaking immigrants residing in Canada outside Quebec were admitted as refugees, compared with less than 16% of the three other populations.

The degree of English–French bilingualism varied from one population to another. In Canada outside Quebec, the bilingualism rate was 91% among French-speaking immigrants, compared with less than 3% among English-speaking immigrants. About half of the immigrants in Quebec were bilingual (English–French), regardless of their FOLS.

The sociodemographic characteristics of the children of immigrants are presented in Table 2. The differences between the four populations tend to be less pronounced among children of immigrants than among immigrants.

A significant proportion of children of immigrants (between 49% and 69%) came from the United States or Europe. This latter percentage (69%) represents the English-speaking children of immigrants living in Quebec, whose parents were, for the most part, born in Southern Europe, primarily in Italy, Greece or Portugal.

The percentage of children of immigrants with a diploma or university degree ranged from 34% to 47%.

As was the case for immigrants, English-French bilingualism among children of immigrants in Canada outside Quebec was significantly higher among the French-speaking population (98%) than among the English-speaking population (8%), although this figure was higher than that observed among immigrants. In Quebec, the English-French bilingualism rate among Frenchspeaking children of immigrants was 81%, a rate that was higher to that observed among immigrants in the province. The English-French bilingualism rate for children of English-speaking immigrants was

Table 3
Employment earnings of women aged 25 to 59 living in Canada outside Quebec and in Quebec, by first official language spoken (FOLS), 2015

		ada Quebec		
	French FOLS	English FOLS	French FOLS	English FOLS
Average annual earnings		dol	ars	
Women aged 25 to 59 with an immigrant background	48,200	45,600	36,600	40,100
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59	45,400	40,700	32,700	33,300
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 15 and 24	44,000	38,900	33,100	31,700
Children of immigrants	53,400	50,500	42,400	45,800
Immigrants admitted before the age of 15	44,400	45,200	37,000	37,400
Second generation	55,400	53,700	43,500	48,700
Mixed generation	56,900	48,900	45,000	43,300
Third generation or higher	49,200	46,500	42,200	42,100
Average weekly earnings <sup>1</sup>				
Women aged 25 to 59 with an immigrant background	1,420	1,290	1,070	1,110
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59	1,390	1,200	960	940
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 15 and 24	1,400	1,170	980	960
Children of immigrants	1,470	1,390	1,210	1,230
Immigrants admitted before the age of 15	1,330	1,300	1,140	1,100
Second generation	1,560	1,460	1,230	1,290
Mixed generation	1,470	1,340	1,240	1,160
Third generation or higher	1,290	1,270	1,120	1,160
Percentage with at least \$10,000 in employment income		per	cent	
Women aged 25 to 59 with an immigrant background	70.7	71.2	66.4	67.2
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59	66.9	65.8	60.5	57.7
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 15 and 24	68.6	67.0	62.3	59.0
Children of immigrants	77.0	76.3	76.2	76.0
Immigrants admitted before the age of 15	72.5	74.8	72.1	70.8
Second generation	77.7	77.8	77.7	77.9
Mixed generation	79.1	75.2	77.4	74.5
Third generation or higher	77.1	73.0	76.8	70.9

<sup>1.</sup> Among people generally working full time. **Source:** Statistics Canada, Census of Population, 2016.

7 percentage points higher than that of French-speaking children of immigrants, at 88%.

The results above show that immigrants and children of immigrants are relatively different. Immigrants who arrived in recent decades are predominantly from new source countries of immigration in the Americas, Africa and Asia, while the children of immigrants are mostly from previous waves of migration from the United States and Europe. Another difference is the distribution of immigrants and their children by level of education: the high percentage of university-educated immigrants is mainly the

result of immigration policies in recent decades (particularly skilled worker programs) that have led to highly educated immigrants being admitted.

# Employment earnings vary by immigrant status in all linguistic communities

The descriptive results for the three indicators used in this article are presented in Table 3 for women aged 25 to 59 and Table 4 for men in the same age group.

Overall, the annual and weekly earnings for both men and women were higher among the Canadian-

Table 4
Employment earnings of men aged 25 to 59 living in Canada outside Quebec and in Quebec, by first official language spoken (FOLS), 2015

		ada Quebec	Que	ebec
	French FOLS	English FOLS	French FOLS	English FOLS
Average annual earnings		doll	ars	
Men aged 25 to 59 with an immigrant background	66,900	67,100	48,200	54,500
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59	65,600	62,700	45,600	46,400
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 15 and 24	61,000	56,000	46,000	43,400
Children of immigrants	70,900	72,100	52,500	62,100
Immigrants admitted before the age of 15	60,500	57,700	43,000	46,600
Second generation	73,000	76,200	53,200	65,300
Mixed generation	74,700	73,900	58,100	63,000
Third generation or higher	68,300	71,600	56,600	59,200
Average weekly earnings <sup>1</sup>				
Men aged 25 to 59 with an immigrant background	1,760	1,680	1,270	1,350
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59	1,760	1,580	1,200	1,180
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 15 and 24	1,690	1,440	1,220	1,190
Children of immigrants	1,800	1,790	1,390	1,500
Immigrants admitted before the age of 15	1,660	1,490	1,140	1,210
Second generation	1,870	1,870	1,410	1,560
Mixed generation	1,830	1,810	1,520	1,510
Third generation or higher	1,710	1,770	1,420	1,480
Percentage with at least \$10,000 in employment income		pero	cent	
Men aged 25 to 59 with an immigrant background	81.8	82.4	78.8	77.4
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59	82.3	82.8	78.6	75.0
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 15 and 24	80.9	80.8	78.1	73.7
Children of immigrants	81.3	82.5	79.3	80.0
Immigrants admitted before the age of 15	78.4	80.3	76.9	76.5
Second generation	79.4	82.9	78.5	81.2
Mixed generation	84.1	83.0	81.7	79.1
Third generation or higher	84.1	81.9	83.2	76.6

<sup>1.</sup> Among people who generally work full time.

**Source:** Statistics Canada, Census of Population, 2016.

born population than among the immigrant population. Among those born in Canada, it is often the second generation—not the third generation or higher-that had the highest earnings, particularly in Canada outside Quebec. For example, among second-generation women living in Canada outside Quebec, average annual earnings were \$55,400 for those with French as their FOLS, compared with \$49,200 for their third-generation counterparts. This situation was the same for people with English as their FOLS.

Although the profile by immigrant status was essentially the same for annual and weekly earnings across all linguistic groups, there were a few exceptions. Within the French-speaking population living in Canada outside Quebec, weekly wages were higher for immigrants who were admitted between the ages of 25 and 59 than they were for the third generation or higher (\$1,760 compared with \$1,710, respectively, for men, and \$1,390 compared with \$1,290, respectively, for women).

The results, however, were different for the proportion of both men and women with at least \$10,000

in employment income. In all linguistic groups, this proportion was significantly lower among immigrant women —particularly those admitted to Canada between the ages of 15 and 59—than among Canadian-born women. The gap between immigrant women and their Canadian-born counterparts ranged from 6 to 10 percentage points in Canada outside Quebec and from 12 to 16 percentage points in Quebec.

The proportion of men with at least \$10,000 in employment income (around 80%) varied little from one group to another. However, this figure was somewhat lower among English-speaking male immigrants and men from the third generation or higher in Ouebec.

When the results for official language majorities and minorities are compared, two distinct profiles emerge. In Canada outside Quebec, the earnings of the French-speaking population (the minority) tend to be higher than those of the Englishspeaking population (the majority), except for second-generation males, the mixed generation (i.e., those born in Canada to an immigrant parent and a Canadian-born parent) and the third generation or higher. In Quebec, the differences between the French-speaking majority and the English-speaking minority are generally smaller.

# In all linguistic groups, immigrants have lower earnings than Canadian-born people

The results presented in the previous section do not take into account the compositional differences that characterize these populations, such as age, length of residence, education level and marital status. In the rest of this study, multivariate

methods are used to account for these factors. First, the differences are examined between population with an immigrant background and the rest of the population within each linguistic community. Second, the differences between official language majorities and minorities are examined for the immigrant and Canadian-born populations.<sup>6</sup>

In this section, differences in annual earnings (in percentage), estimated using separate regressions for Canada outside Quebec and Quebec, are shown between the population with an immigrant background and people from the third generation or higher (Table 5). The third generation or higher population is the reference category.

The results show that annual earnings are consistently higher among the Canadian-born population than the immigrant population. This gap is even more pronounced than the one presented in Table I, mainly because of the differences in educational attainment between immigrants and the rest of the adult population.7 After taking other factors into account, the annual earnings of immigrants were lower than those of people from the third generation or higher by a margin of 7% to 31%except for female English-speaking immigrants admitted before the age of 15 (in Canada outside Quebec and in Quebec), for whom annual earnings were comparable to those of their Canadian-born counterparts.

Among non-immigrants<sup>8</sup>, the results show that there was little difference in earnings between the second generation, the mixed generation, and the third generation or higher. This is observed in both linguistic groups, both in Quebec and in the rest of Canada, but some significant differences remain between the Canadian-born populations, often

Table 5
Percentage difference in annual earnings between people with an immigrant background and people from the third generation or higher, population aged 25 to 59 living in Canada outside Quebec and in Quebec, 2015

	Canada	
	outside Quebec	Quebec
Women whose FOLS is French	percent	
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59	-22.4*	-26.5*
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 15 and 24	-12.4*	-15.9*
Immigrants admitted before the age of 15	-7.8*	-7.0*
Second generation	-1.3	-0.8
Mixed generation	-1.7	-1.7
Third generation or higher (ref.)		
Women whose FOLS is English		
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59	-22.9*	-25.1*
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 15 and 24	-11.9*	-14.9*
Immigrants admitted before the age of 15	-1.2*	-1.2
Second generation	3.8*	2.6*
Mixed generation	0.7	-0.4
Third generation or higher (ref.)	•••	
Men whose FOLS is French		
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59	-24.9*	-30.2*
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 15 and 24	-15.3*	-20.9*
Immigrants admitted before the age of 15	-12.6*	-17.2*
Second generation	-8.2*	-8.7*
Mixed generation	-3.5	-5.2*
Third generation or higher (ref.)		
Men whose FOLS is English		
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59	-31.1*	-29.6*
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 15 and 24	-24.2*	-20.2*
Immigrants admitted before the age of 15	-11.3*	-10.6*
Second generation	-2.6*	-1.9
Mixed generation	-2.3	-0.7
Third generation or higher (ref.)		

<sup>...</sup> not applicable

Note: The model includes the following explanatory variables: immigrant or generation status, number of years of labour market experience, education level, occupation, industry, marital status, and region of residence. For Quebec, the model also includes English–French bilingualism.

Source: Statistics Canada, Census of Population, 2016.

to the advantage of those from the third generation or higher. However, a few exceptions can be observed mainly among English-speaking women (both in Canada outside Quebec and in Quebec). In this group, the annual earnings of second generation Canadians were 2% to 4% higher than the reference category (the third generation or higher population).

The results also show that the younger immigrants are when admitted, the higher their annual earnings, regardless of linguistic

group. For example, the annual earnings of English-speaking male immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59 were about 30% lower than those of third-generation men (both in Quebec and in Canada outside Quebec). This difference was 20% to 24% among those admitted between the ages of 15 and 24, and 11% for those who arrived before the age of 15.

Immigrants who arrive in Canada at a young age learn the country's official languages more quickly and more fully. They also have more

significantly different from reference category (p < 0.05)

Percentage difference in weekly earnings<sup>1</sup> between people with an immigrant background and people from the third generation or higher, population aged 25 to 59 living in Canada outside Quebec and in Quebec, 2015

	Canada	
	outside Quebec	Quebec
Women whose FOLS is French	percent	
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59	-22.0*	-25.7*
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 15 and 24	-9.4*	-15.8*
Immigrants admitted before the age of 15	-7.1*	-7.5*
Second generation	-1.5	-1.6
Mixed generation	0.3	-1.8
Third generation or higher (ref.)		
Women whose FOLS is English		
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59	-25.2*	-27.0*
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 15 and 24	-14.8*	-17.7*
Immigrants admitted before the age of 15	-2.1*	-2.6
Second generation	3.1*	2.5*
Mixed generation	0.9*	-0.4
Third generation or higher (ref.)		
Men whose FOLS is French		
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59	-24.6*	-30.2*
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 15 and 24	-15.0*	-21.8*
Immigrants admitted before the age of 15	-8.7*	-18.6*
Second generation	-6.6*	-9.4*
Mixed generation	-2.3	-4.2*
Third generation or higher (ref.)		
Men whose FOLS is English		
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59	-31.8*	-30.7*
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 15 and 24	-25.4*	-21.8*
Immigrants admitted before the age of 15	-12.4*	-13.1*
Second generation	-3.2*	-3.3*
Mixed generation	-2.3*	-1.7
Third generation or higher (ref.)		

Note: The model includes the following explanatory variables: immigrant or generation status, number of years of labour market experience, education level, marital status, and region of residence. For Quebec, the model also includes English-French bilingualism.

Source: Statistics Canada, Census of Population, 2016.

opportunities to develop social networks across the country, including a higher likelihood of forming a union with a Canadianborn person. Furthermore, they generally complete their education in Canada. After controlling for level of education and other factors, results showed that immigrants who were admitted before the age of 15 had earnings that were higher than those of other immigrants and were closer to those of the Canadian-born population-more so for women. These results were

essentially the same in Quebec and the rest of Canada, for both the French-speaking and the Englishspeaking populations.

The results on the weekly earnings of full-time workers are similar to those obtained for annual earnings, both in Canada outside Quebec and in Quebec (Table 6). In almost all cases, there were significant differences in earnings between immigrants and the Canadian-born population and, for the most part, people from the third generation or higher had the

highest earnings (except for Englishspeaking women, where second generation people had the highest earnings in both Canada outside Quebec and in Quebec).

#### **Immigrants were less likely** to have at least \$10,000 in employment income

The results associated with the proportion of people who reported at least \$10,000 in employment income in 2015, which can be interpreted as having at least some degree of participation in the labour market, also showed a significant gap between immigrants and the Canadian-born population (Table 7).

In all linguistic groups, the predicted probability of having at least \$10,000 in employment income ranged from 58% to 67% for immigrant women who were admitted between the ages of 15 and 59, while this figure was 72% and over for Canadianborn women. Adjusted rates were higher for men than women, but the differences between immigrants and the Canadian-born population were also significant for men, with adjusted percentages for immigrants ranging from 72% to 78%, while those for the Canadian-born population ranged from 77% to 85%.

The results presented to date show that, in each linguistic group, immigrants have less favourable outcomes than the Canadian-born population, and that the magnitude of the earnings' gap is similar in all four linguistic group. In the next section, comparisons are made between official language minorities and majorities in Canada outside Quebec and in Quebec.

<sup>...</sup> not applicable \* significantly different from reference category (p < 0.05)

<sup>1.</sup> Among people who generally work full time.

#### In Canada outside Quebec, the earnings of Frenchspeaking immigrants are similar or higher than those of English-speaking immigrants

To see how immigrants belonging to linguistic minorities compare with those belonging to the majority, a series of regressions were estimated for each linguistic community, by sex and immigrant or generation status (eight groups). The results9 show the relative differences between the official language minority and majority for each population defined by immigrant and generation status and sex for each of the three indicators analyzed in this article: annual earnings, weekly earnings among full-time workers and the proportion of people with at least \$10,000 in employment income. A negative coefficient corresponds to a lower result than the linguistic majority and a positive coefficient corresponds to a higher result.

Table 8 shows the extent to which the minority differ from the majority in terms of annual earnings. Outside Quebec, the earnings of Frenchspeaking people with an immigrant background are comparable with those of their English-speaking counterparts, and are even higher in some cases, particularly among women. For example, female children of immigrants whose FOLS is French had earnings that were almost 6% higher than those of Englishspeaking children of immigrants. A comparable result was observed among French-speaking immigrant women admitted between the ages of 15 and 59.

Table 7
Predicted probability of reporting at least \$10,000 in employment income,
population aged 25 to 59 living in Canada outside Québec and in Québec, 2015

	Canada outside Quebec	Quebec
Women whose FOLS is French	predicted prob	ability
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59	58.3*	56.6*
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 15 and 24	64.1*	63.8*
Immigrants admitted before the age of 15	67.4*	69.8*
Second generation	71.8*	74.6*
Mixed generation	75.9*	74.0*
Third generation or higher (ref.)	78.2	77.2
Women whose FOLS is English		
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59	61.1*	58.1*
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 15 and 24	67.3*	63.4*
Immigrants admitted before the age of 15	73.0*	69.9*
Second generation	75.9*	74.6*
Mixed generation	74.8	72.7
Third generation or higher (ref.)	74.5	72.3
Men whose FOLS is French		
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59	75.1*	71.6*
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 15 and 24	76.8*	75.3*
Immigrants admitted before the age of 15	75.6*	75.2*
Second generation	77.3*	78.2*
Mixed generation	82.7*	80.7*
Third generation or higher (ref.)	84.9	83.8
Men whose FOLS is English		
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59	77.1*	71.8*
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 15 and 24	77.7*	73.8*
Immigrants admitted before the age of 15	79.1*	76.5*
Second generation	82.8*	80.2*
Mixed generation	83.3	79.6
Third generation or higher (ref.)	83.4	78.9

<sup>\*</sup> significantly different from reference category (p < 0.05)

**Note:** The model includes the following explanatory variables: age, education level, marital status, region of residence, immigrant or generation status. For Quebec, the model also includes English–French bilingualism. **Source:** Statistics Canada, Census of Population, 2016.

Of note, a significant difference was also observed among the third generation or higher population. In Canada outside Quebec, French-speaking women from the third generation or higher earned 6% more than their English-speaking counterparts (this gap was 3% for men). In other words, the results for the population with an immigrant background mirrored those observed for the rest of the population (third generation or higher).

#### In Quebec, the earnings of English-speaking immigrants were similar to those of French-speaking immigrants

In Quebec, the annual earnings of English-speaking immigrants who arrived in the country between the ages of 15 and 59 were not statistically different from those of their French-speaking counterparts. By contrast, the earnings of English-speaking children of immigrants tended to be lower than those of their French-speaking counterparts.

Table 8
Percentage difference between the official language minority and majority in terms of annual earnings, men and women aged 25 to 59 living in Canada outside Quebec and in Quebec, 2015

	Canada outside Quebec		Quebec	
	Women	Men	Women	Men
		per	cent	
Population with an immigrant background	7.1*	3.8*	-4.0*	-2.4*
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59	5.6*	-1.7	-0.5	1.3
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 15 and 24	6.4*	1.7	-1.9	-0.3
Children of immigrants	5.5*	2.0	-5.2*	-4.6*
Immigrants admitted before the age of 15	5.0	2.1	-1.2	-1.8
Second generation	6.0*	-0.4	-4.1*	-4.5*
Mixed generation	5.5*	3.5	-8.0*	-5.8*
Third generation or higher	5.8*	3.3*	-6.0*	-8.8*

 $<sup>^{\</sup>star}$  significantly different from reference category (p < 0.05)

Note: The model includes the following variables: part-time or full-time work, number of weeks worked, number of years of labour market experience, education level, occupation, industry, marital status, region of residence, first official language spoken (FOLS) and, for the immigrant population, region of ancestry and, for immigrants admitted at age 15 and over, unofficial mother tongue and admission category. For Quebec, the model also includes English–French bilingualism. The reference category is the official language majority population (English FOLS in Canada outside Quebec and French FOLS in Quebec).

Source: Statistics Canada, Census of Population, 2016.

Table 9
Percentage difference between the official language minority and majority in terms of weekly earnings<sup>1</sup>, men and women aged 25 to 59 living in Canada outside Quebec and in Quebec, 2015

	Canada outside Quebec		Quebec	
	Women	Men	Women	Men
		per	cent	
Population with an immigrant background	8.2*	3.8*	-2.4*	-1.6*
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59	5.5*	-2.6	0.7	2.3
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 15 and 24	9.3*	1.9	-1.3	1.0
Children of immigrants	6.0*	3.5*	-3.1*	-4.4*
Immigrants admitted before the age of 15	5.9	6.5	-0.6	-1.6
Second generation	6.0*	0.7	-2.4	-4.2*
Mixed generation	6.2*	4.1	-4.9*	-6.4*
Third generation or higher	4.3*	2.6*	-3.3*	-7.1*

<sup>\*</sup> significantly different from reference category (p < 0.05)

**Note:** The complete model includes the following variables: part-time or full-time work, number of weeks worked, number of years of labour market experience, education level, marital status, region of residence, first official language spoken (FOLS) and, for the population with an immigrant background, region of ancestry and, for immigrants admitted at age 15 and over, unofficial mother tongue and admission category. For Quebec, the model also includes English–French bilingualism. The reference category is the official language majority population (English FOLS in Canada outside Quebec and French FOLS in Quebec).

Source: Statistics Canada, Census of Population, 2016.

More particularly, among women and men from the second or mixed English-speaking generation, earnings were 4% to 8% lower than those of their French-speaking counterparts. Similar results were

also observed in the third generation or higher. English-speaking women in this latter group earned 6% less than their French-speaking counterparts, and this gap was even higher for men (9%).

The results obtained for weekly earnings (Table 9) were generally similar to those obtained for annual earnings: in Canada outside Quebec, the French-speaking population had earnings that were comparable with—or even higher than—those of the majority, particularly among women. In contrast, in Quebec, the English-speaking population had lower weekly earnings than the French-speaking majority, with the exception of immigrants admitted between the ages of 15 and 59.

The differences were even more pronounced when examining the adjusted proportions of those with at least \$10,000 in employment income (Table 10). In Quebec, the proportions of those who were members of the English-speaking minority were almost always lower than those of the majority, for both women and men. The differences between the majority and the minority were particularly high among the third generation or higher population: English-speaking women and men were more than 7 percentage points less likely than their French-speaking counterparts to have employment earnings of at least \$10,000.

In Canada outside Quebec, the differences between the French-speaking minority and the English-speaking majority were either statistically insignificant or higher for the French-speaking minority. To For example, among female immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59, the probability of having at least \$10,000 in employment income was 2 percentage points higher for French-speaking immigrants relative to their English-speaking counterparts.

<sup>1.</sup> Among people who generally work full time.

Table 10
Percentage difference between the official language minority and majority in terms of the proportion of people with at least \$10,000 in employment income, men and women aged 25 to 59 living in Canada outside Quebec and in Quebec, 2015

	Canada outside Quebec		Quebec	
	Women	Men	Women	Men
		percenta	ge points	
Population with an immigrant background	2.1*	0.7	-3.5*	-1.9*
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59	1.9*	1.2*	-3.0*	-1.4*
Immigrants admitted between the ages of 15 and 24	3.1*	1.1	-2.3*	-2.3*
Children of immigrants	0.3	-0.3	-2.9*	-1.4*
Immigrants admitted before the age of 15	-0.6	-0.2	-3.2*	-1.8
Second generation	-1.2	-2.2	-1.8*	-0.2
Mixed generation	1.9	1.0	-4.0*	-2.7*
Third generation or higher	3.5*	2.6*	-7.4*	-7.1*

<sup>\*</sup> significantly different from reference category (p < 0.05)

Note: The model includes the following variables: age, education level, marital status, region of residence, first official language spoken (FOLS) and, for the population with an immigrant background, region of ancestry and, for immigrants admitted at age 15 and over, unofficial mother tongue and admission category. For Quebec, the model also includes English–French bilingualism. The reference category is the official language majority population (English FOLS in Canada outside Quebec and French FOLS in Quebec).

Source: Statistics Canada, Census of Population, 2016.

#### Conclusion

The results of this study showed that the earnings of immigrants who arrived between the ages of 15 and 59 are lower than those of the children of immigrants and of people from the third generation or higher, both in Quebec and in the rest of Canada. However, the earnings of children of immigrants are comparable with those of the third generation or higher in the four linguistic communities and therefore better than those of immigrants, both in Quebec and in the rest of Canada.

This study also showed that in Canada outside Quebec, the French-speaking population had economic outcomes that were comparable with or better than the English-speaking population—a finding that also applies to the third generation or higher population. The high level of English-French bilingualism among the Frenchspeaking population could have a positive effect on their integration into the labour market, as the official status of French allows some of these immigrants to integrate into French-speaking institutions or institutions where the knowledge of French represents an asset (e.g.,

schools, public administration and non-profit organizations). A more in-depth study on this topic would be required.

In Quebec, by contrast, the results for the English-speaking minority are generally lower than those for the French-speaking population, particularly among the children of immigrants and people of the third generation or higher.11 The English-speaking population may face some barriers or obstacles that are not necessarily explained by census data. Furthermore, a study on different aspects-such as the neighbourhood or region of residence in Montréal and Quebec, as well as the detailed industry and occupation-would undoubtedly enhance understanding of the labour market integration issues facing the English-speaking population living in Quebec. This study, however, uses various indicators based on income data from the Census, and therefore does not provide any information about other indicators of financial well-being, such as debt, assets, or wealth. More research will be needed to understand the economic integration of people with an immigrant background who belong to an official language minority in Canada.

**René Houle** is a senior research analyst with Statistics Canada's Social and Aboriginal Statistics Division. This report was made possible thanks to the support of Immigration, Refugees and Citizenship Canada.

#### Data sources, methods and definitions

This study is based on 2016 Census data, which includes information on earnings from tax files (T4) for the 2015 tax year. <sup>12</sup>

Multivariate models were used to analyze earnings and the proportion of people with employment income. The basic model was estimated using a linear (least squares) regression with the natural logarithm of earnings as the dependent variable. The analysis was based on the population aged 25 to 59, and people without earnings were excluded from the analyses. The analysis of the population with earnings of at least \$10,000 was done using logistic regressions. This indicator aims to estimate the proportion of people who participated actively in the labour market in 2015.

Three variables were central to the analyses because they define the subpopulations being examined: the linguistic community, immigrant or generation status, and sex.

Four types of linguistic communities were defined: the population in Canada outside Quebec with French as their first official language spoken (FOLS), the population in Canada outside Quebec with English as their FOLS, the population in Quebec with French as their FOLS, and the population in Quebec with English as their FOLS. The remaining group of people whose FOLS was neither French nor English was excluded from the analyses.

Immigrant (or generation) status is used to identify immigrants and the children of immigrants, i.e., the total population considered in this article as having an immigrant background. Immigrants are people born outside Canada and granted permanent residence in Canada. This study excludes nonpermanent residents. It covers immigrants who became permanent residents of Canada from 1980 to 2014. Focusing on those immigrants allows the admission category to be included as an independent variable. If Immigrants admitted in 2015 or 2016 were excluded from analysis because they may not have had a full year of applicable earnings.

The children of immigrants were classified into three demographic groups:

- Second generation (Generation 2.0): Canadian-born individuals with both parents born outside Canada.
- Mixed generation (Generation 2.5): Individuals born in Canada with one parent born outside Canada and one parent born in Canada.
- Individuals admitted to Canada before the age of 15 (Generation 1.5) who, for the purposes of this study, are also considered to be part of the population of children of immigrants. Studies have shown that these individuals—who have been socialized primarily in Canada within immigrant families—have similar characteristics and behaviours to second-generation individuals in terms of composition by the country of birth of their parents, labour force participation, education and income. <sup>14</sup>

The rest of the population is made up of people from the third generation or higher—people whose parents were both born in Canada. This group includes a small number of foreign-born individuals whose parents were both born in Canada (e.g., children born to Canadian parents living abroad or children adopted internationally).

The analyses were produced separately by sex because of the specific nature of men's and women's labour market participation, particularly in terms of job distribution by industry and occupation.

Additional variables used in the models were socioeconomic or migratory in nature. For the entire population with an immigrant background (i.e., immigrants and children of immigrants), a variable called the region of ancestry was derived based on the parents' place of birth for the purposes of this study. This corresponds to the mother's country of birth, unless the mother was born in Canada (as is the case for some people from the mixed generation), in which case the father's place of birth is used.<sup>15</sup> The selected categories are large geographical regions (e.g., the Caribbean, Sub-Saharan Africa, Southeast Asia). Other socioeconomic variables include:

- a variable indicating whether the person is employed full time
- number of weeks worked during the year (2015)
- years of experience in the labour market<sup>16</sup>
- highest level of education
- marital status
- · detailed area of residence
- mother tongue other than English or French
- industry and occupation
- English–French bilingualism (Quebec only).

The following variables apply only to immigrants:

- duration of residence in Canada<sup>17</sup>
- admission category.

The first economic indicator examined is annual earnings in 2015, which include wages, salaries and commissions. When annual earnings are used, one question is whether or not the work characteristics (part-time or full-time work and the number of weeks worked) should be included in the models. 18 Ignoring the full-time or part-time nature of work and weeks worked could highlight some of the pressures faced by some immigrants in the labour market that result from possible discrimination or insufficient knowledge of labour market opportunities or job vacancies that result in part-time work or fewer weeks worked, for example. However, because some immigrants choose to work part time and fewer weeks (especially women), taking the full-time or part-time nature of the work and the number of weeks worked into account in alternative regressions can also be justified. The objective of both cases is to have an overall measure of labour market success.

The second indicator analyzed is the weekly earnings of people employed full time, which makes it possible to compare pay rates. Weekly earnings are obtained by dividing wages, salaries and commissions by the number of weeks worked in 2015.

The third indicator is the proportion of people who reported at least \$10,000 in employment income in 2015 (including wages, salaries and commissions and net self-employment income), which can be used as an indicator of labour market participation.

#### **Notes**

- Examples of studies focusing on immigrants include, for example, Aydemir and Sketerud (2004); Grant and Sweetman (2004); Green and Worswick (2004); Hum and Simpson (2004); Frenette and Morissette (2005); Picot and Sweetman (2005); Hou and Coulombe (2010). Examples of studies focusing on children of immigrants include Boyd and Grieco (1998); Aydemir, Chen and Corak (2005); Palameta (2007); Abada, Hou and Ram (2009).
- 2. For a literature review, see Boyd and Cao (2009).
- 3. See Giles, Bourhis and Taylor (1977).
- 4. See Houle and Corbeil (2017).
- In this article, "French-speaking people" are those whose first official language spoken (FOLS) is French, and "English-speaking people" are those whose FOLS is English.
- In this study, the results from the regressions are expressed in percentage terms by taking the antilog of the estimated dummy coefficients and subtracting one (Halvorsen and Palmquist, 1980).
- 7. In the sample, 44% of immigrants admitted to Canada since 1980 reported having a university education, compared with 25% of the Canadian-born population. This figure was 50% among immigrants admitted between the ages of 25 and 59. Level of education is a selection criterion for a significant proportion of immigrants, resulting in a higher percentage of them holding a university degree compared with the Canadian-born population.
- Non-immigrants refer to those who belong to the mixed generation, the second generation, or the third generation or higher. See the section <u>Data sources</u>, methods and definitions.
- In this section, only the results of the full models (with a maximum of explanatory variables) are presented. The results of the other models are available upon request.

- 10. Overall, the results on the differences between the official language minority and majority are reflected in their low-income status. In Quebec in particular, low-income rates are consistently higher among the English-speaking population than among the French-speaking population with an immigrant background, and even among the third generation or higher population. The situation is more nuanced in Canada outside Quebec, although, overall, the low-income rates of the French-speaking population with an immigrant background are equal to or lower than those of the English-speaking population. The results of low-income regressions are available upon request.
- II. In addition to average annual earnings, differences in median annual earnings were also examined in this study. Although median earnings are consistently lower than average earnings, similar differences were found between people with an immigrant background and people from the third generation or higher, and between majority and minority official language populations.
- 12. See Statistics Canada (2017b).
- The admission category in the census is available only for immigrants admitted since 1980 (Statistics Canada, 2017a).
- 14. See Boyd (2002).
- 15. See Statistics Canada (2017c).
- 16. This is calculated as follows: age number of years of education 6. The number of years of education is obtained by matching the highest diploma obtained with the average number of years of education required to obtain this diploma (see Hou and Coulombe, 2010). In the regressions, work experience is represented by two continuous variables: EXP and EXP squared.
- 17. In the regressions, length of residence is represented by two continuous variables: LENGTH and LENGTH squared. Immigrants' length of residence in Canada is sometimes considered a proxy for the number of years of post-school training completed after migration (Chiswick, 1978), including language learning and development.
- 18. See Hou and Coulombe (2010).

#### References

- Abada, Teresa, Feng Hou and Bali Ram. 2009. "Ethnic differences in educational attainment among the children of Canadian immigrants." Canadian Journal of Sociology / Cahiers canadiens de sociologie. Vol. 34, no. 1. p. I-28.
- Aydemir, Abdurrahman and Mikal Skuterud. 2004. Explaining the Deteriorating Entry Earnings of Canada's Immigrant Cohorts: 1966–2000. Analytical Studies Branch Research Paper Series. May. Statistics Canada Catalogue no. IIF0019M - No. 225. 38 p.
- Aydemir, Abdurrahman, Wen-Hao Chen and Miles Corak. 2005. Intergenerational Earnings Mobility Among the Children of Canadian Immigrants. Analytical Studies Branch Research Paper Series. October. Statistics Canada Catalogue no. 11F0019M - No. 267.
- Boyd, Monica. 2002. "Educational attainments of immigrant offspring: Successor segmented assimilation?" International Migration Review. Winter. Vol. 36, no. 4. p. 1037–1060.
- Boyd, Monica and Xingshan Cao. 2009. "Immigrant language proficiency, earnings, and language policies." Canadian Studies in Population. Summer. Vol. 36, nos. 1 and 2. p. 63-86.
- Boyd, Monica and Elizabeth M. Grieco. 1998. "Triumphant transitions: Socioeconomic achievement of the second generation in Canada." International Migration Review. Winter. Vol. 32, no. 4. p. 853-876.
- Chiswick, Barry R. 1978. "The effect of Americanization on the earnings of foreign-born men." Journal of Political Economy. October. Vol. 86, no. 5. p. 897-921.
- Frenette, Marc and René Morissette. 2005. "Will they ever converge? Earnings of immigrant and Canadianborn workers over the last two decades." International Migration Review. Spring. Vol. 39, no. 1. p. 228–257.
- Giles, Howard, Richard Y. Bourhis and Donald M. Taylor. 1977. "Towards a theory of language in ethnic group relations." Language, Ethnicity and Intergroup Relations, published under the direction of Howard Giles. London: Academic Press. p. 307-348.
- Grant, Hugh and Arthur Sweetman. 2004. "Introduction to economic and urban issues in Canadian immigration policy." Canadian Journal of Urban Research. Summer. Vol. 13, no. 1. p. 1–24.

- Green, David A. and Christopher Worswick. 2004. Immigrant Earnings Profiles in the Presence of Human Capital Investment: Measuring Cohort and Macro Effects. London: Institute for Fiscal Studies (IFS), IFS Working Paper. January. no. W04/13. 56 p.
- Halvorsen, Robert and Raymond Palmquist. 1980. "The Interpretation of Dummy Variables in Semilogarithmic Equations." American Economic Review. June. Vol. 70, no. 3. P. 474-75.
- Hou, Feng and Simon Coulombe. 2010. "Earnings gaps for Canadian-born visible minorities in the public and private sectors." Canadian Public Policy / Analyse de politiques. March. Vol. 36, no. 1. p. 29-43.
- Houle, René and Jean-Pierre Corbeil. 2017. "Language projections for Canada, 2011 to 2036."Ethnicity, Language and Immigration Thematic Series. January. Statistics Canada Catalogue no. 89-657-X2017001.
- Hum, Derek and Wayne Simpson. 2004. "Economic integration of immigrants to Canada: A short survey." Canadian Journal of Urban Research. Summer. Vol. 13, no. I. p. 46-61.
- Palameta, Boris. 2007. "Economic integration of immigrants' children." Perspectives on Labour and Income. October. Vol. 8, no. 10. Statistics Canada Catalogue no. 75-001-X. p. 5-16.
- Picot, Garnett. 2004. "The deteriorating economic welfare of Canadian immigrants." Canadian Journal of Urban Research. Summer. Vol. 13, no. 1. p. 25-45.
- Picot, Garnett and Arthur Sweetman. 2005. The Deteriorating Economic Welfare of Immigrants and Possible Causes: Update 2005. Analytical Studies Branch Research Paper Series. Statistics Canada Catalogue no. 11F0019M – No. 262. 26 p.
- Statistics Canada. 2017a. Release and Concepts Overview, 2016 Census of Population: Immigration and Ethnocultural Diversity. August. Catalogue no. 98-501-X2016008.
- Statistics Canada. 2017b. Income Reference Guide, Census of Population, 2016. September. Catalogue no. 98-500-X2016004.
- Statistics Canada. 2017c. "Children with an immigrant background: Bridging cultures." Census in Brief, 2016 Census of Population. October. Statistics Canada Catalogue no. 98-200-X2016015.